Serial Number: 10/655,860

Filing Date: 09/05/2003

Response to Office Action of 03/17/2006

Practitioner's Docket: 65448.00010

Remarks

Independent claims 1 and 24 are amended to further recite that the claimed bearing

cleaning composition contains a high molecular weight sulfonic acid. Claim 6 has also been

amended to recite that the alkylbenzene sulfonic acid is the recited high molecular weight

sulfonic acid from claim 1. Support for this limitation can be found at, for example, ¶¶ 9, 10,

and 16. The specification discloses that the claimed composition preferably contains an

alkylbenzene sulfonic acid, which is a high molecular weigh sulfonic acid. See ¶ 9. The most

preferred high molecular weight sulfonic acid is about 96 weight percent of C_{10} - C_{16} alkylbenzene

sulfonic acid. See ¶ 10. The specification further discusses that it is the high molecular weight

sulfonic acid that acts as a catalyst in the phase transition of the composition from a Newtonian

fluid to a Non-Newtonian grease-like composition. See ¶ 16.

Claims 11, 18, 21, and 24 have been amended to recite that the polishing agent is

crystalline calcium carbonate as opposed to a non-crystalline form. Support for this limitation

can be found at, for example ¶¶ 8, 11 and 16. The specification discloses that the polishing agent

polishes the bearings and removes contaminants from around the bearing. See ¶ 8. It is also

discussed that amounts of the polishing agent at the high end of the disclosed range will produce

a more abrasive composition that may be less desirable for use with bearings made of softer

materials. See ¶ 11. The specification also discloses that the particularly preferred material for

the polishing agent is calcite, which is a crystalline form of calcium carbonate, and that the

preferred polishing agent has a hexagonal crystalline structure with an irregular shape. See, ¶ 11.

The phase transition of the composition to a Non-Newtonian grease-like composition is disclosed

as being associated with the conversion of non-crystalline calcium carbonate particles to

Page 8 of 14

Serial Number: 10/655,860 Filing Date: 09/05/2003

Response to Office Action of 03/17/2006

Practitioner's Docket: 65448.00010

crystalline wafer-like calcite particles. See, ¶ 16. An irregular crystalline shape would provide

the required abrasiveness to the composition so that it can polish and remove contaminants from

the bearing assembly. As such, it would be clear to one of skill in the art that an abrasive

crystalline form of calcium carbonate, as opposed to a non-abrasive amorphous form, would be

necessary in order to function as the polishing agent recited in the claims.

Claim 24 has also been amended to recite that the bearing assembly containing the

disclosed bearing cleaning composition is operated for a period of time with the bearing cleaning

composition in order to remove contaminants from the surface of the bearing assembly. Support

for this limitation can be found at, for example ¶¶ 6 and 23. The disclosed method involves

running the bearing assembly with the cleaning composition for a limited period to clean the

bearing. See ¶ 6. The specification further discloses that during the period when the bearing is

being run with the cleaning composition in it, the polishing agent in the cleaning composition

causes contaminants to be loosened or abraded from the metal surfaces inside the bearing and

suspended in the cleaning composition. See ¶ 23. Therefore, all of the limitations of the

currently presented claims are fully supported by the specification.

The currently amended claims are not anticipated by, nor are they rendered obvious in

light of either Waynick or Jao. Waynick discloses a lubricating grease for use in front wheel

drive joints in automobiles. Calcium carbonate is added to the completed grease in Waynick as

part of an anti-wear additive. Col. 11, ll. 36-40. Instead of disclosing the use of crystalline

calcium carbonate, Waynick discloses that food grade calcium carbonate should be used in part

"to minimize abrasive contaminants." Col. 11, 11. 57-60. Therefore, the calcium carbonate

disclosed in Waynick is not abrasive enough to be considered a polishing agent. Not only does

Page 9 of 14

DALLAS: 65448.00010: 1502972v1

Serial Number: 10/655,860 Filing Date: 09/05/2003

Response to Office Action of 03/17/2006

Practitioner's Docket: 65448.00010

Waynick not disclose that the calcium carbonate is sufficiently abrasive, it teaches away from the

use of abrasive crystalline carbonate by teaching that care should be taken to minimize even

contaminants in the calcium carbonate that may be abrasive. Waynick, col. 11, 11. 57-60.

Therefore, despite the fact that Waynick discloses the use of calcium carbonate in a grease

composition, it does not disclose the use of a polishing agent, whether made of calcium

carbonate or any other substance.

Waynick also does not disclose the use of a high molecular weight sulfonic acid as part of

the thickening system for the grease. Instead, Waynick discloses the use of polyurea thickeners

and indicates that these are the preferred thickeners. Col. 5, 11. 12-20. In contrast, the

specification of the invention discloses that the claimed composition is not recommended for use

as part of a polyurea greases. See ¶ 21. Instead of a polyurea thickener, the invention discloses

the use of a high molecular weight sulfonic acid and calcium carbonate to transition the

composition from a Newtonian fluid to a Non-Newtonian grease-like composition. See ¶ 16.

Thus Waynick does not disclose and in fact teaches away from the use of high molecular weight

sulfonic acids as part of the thickening system for the overbased calcium sulfonate grease by

directing one of skill in the art toward polyurea thickeners.

While Waynick does disclose that calcium sulfonate can be used in the composition, it

does not disclose the use of an overbased calcium sulfonate in addition to a polishing compound,

such as crystalline calcium carbonate. Instead, it discloses that calcium sulfonate that is

overbased with calcium carbonate can be used as the source of the calcium carbonate additive in

the final grease. Col. 13, 11. 9-22. In such a case, the calcium carbonate is a part of the

overbased calcium sulfonate and is not a separate component of the composition as is recited in

Page 10 of 14

Serial Number: 10/655,860

Filing Date: 09/05/2003

Response to Office Action of 03/17/2006 Practitioner's Docket: 65448.00010

the current claims. Nor is there any disclosure that the calcium carbonate that is used to overbase

the calcium sulfonate would be an abrasive crystalline form that could serve as a polishing agent.

In fact, as disclosed in Jao, it is likely that the calcium carbonate used to overbase the sulfonate

will be in an amorphous form. See, e.g., Jao, col. 3, 11. 53-54 (example 1); col. 4, 11. 41-42

(example 3). Therefore, there is no disclosure or suggestion in Waynick of a composition that

contains an overbased calcium sulfonate and a polishing agent, such as crystalline calcium

carbonate.

The Jao reference does not disclose or suggest to one of skill in the art to modify

Waynick to achieve the claimed invention. Jao discloses the in-situ formation of calcium

carbonate through the addition of calcium oxide or calcium hydroxide and bubbling carbon

dioxide through the mixture. Col. 1, ll. 34-40. This results in the in-situ creation of amorphous

calcium carbonate in the grease. See e.g., col. 3, 11. 53-54 (example 1); col. 4, 11. 41-42 (example

3). Amorphous calcium carbonate lacks the hardness and abrasiveness that is necessary to

function as a polishing agent in the grease. The only disclosed purpose for including calcium

carbonate in the final grease disclosed in Jao is to overbase the calcium sulfonate grease. Col. 1,

ll. 18-25. Therefore, Jao does not suggest the modification of the grease of Waynick to form the

claimed invention.

None of the prior art references, either alone or in combination, disclose a method of

using the disclosed bearing cleaning composition of the invention for a limited time in a running

system to clean contaminants off a bearing while it is in service. Instead, the prior art

compositions cited by the examiner were used as lubricating oil and greases. None of the prior

art references disclosed using any composition in the bearing for a limited time to polish the

Page 11 of 14

DALLAS: 65448.00010: 1502972v1

Serial Number: 10/655,860

Filing Date: 09/05/2003

Response to Office Action of 03/17/2006

Practitioner's Docket: 65448.00010

bearings and to remove contaminants, but instead were merely disclosed as the regular lubricants

for structures such as bearings.

Specifically, Schnacke merely discloses a particular type of bearing structure that can be

used to replace the grease in the bearing with fresh grease. The replacement of grease using

various fittings, such as a grease zert and grease guns is known and does not anticipate or render

obvious the claimed method. While simply replacing the grease with fresh grease will remove

any contaminants that are present in the grease itself, it does nothing to clean contaminants off

the bearing surfaces. The method disclosed in Schnacke still required the unit to be shut down

periodically so that the bearing can be broken down and disassembled in order to clean

contaminants off the metal surfaces of the bearing. As discussed in the specification, this results

in the use of hazardous hydrocarbon solvents and requires downtime for the equipment or

machinery while the bearing is being cleaned.

The claimed invention avoids this by using a cleaning composition in the bearing

assembly for a limited time while the bearing remains in service. See ¶ 6. What is currently

claimed is the removal of one or more contaminants from the surface of the bearing assembly by

operating it for a period of time with the bearing cleaning composition. This feature is not taught

or suggested in any of the prior art references. None of the prior art references disclose the use

of a bearing cleaning compound that displaces the old grease, cleans and polishes the surfaces of

the bearings while the equipment or machinery is in operation, and is then replaced by new

grease.

Contrary to the examiner's assertion, it would not be obvious to use any prior art

composition to clean the bearings according to the method of Scheacke. There is no suggestion

Page 12 of 14

Serial Number: 10/655.860 Filing Date: 09/05/2003

Response to Office Action of 03/17/2006

Practitioner's Docket: 65448.00010

or motivation that a grease with a polishing agent could be used to clean the bearing surfaces.

The cited prior art in fact teaches away from using calcium carbonate that is abrasive enough to

act as a polishing agent in a grease composition. Waynick teaches that food grade calcium

carbonate should be used in order to minimize abrasive contaminants that may be present.

Waynick, col. 11, ll. 55-59. Likewise, Jao discloses the in-situ formation of only amorphous

calcium carbonate in the grease, which also would not serve to polish and remove contaminants

from the metal surfaces of the bearing assembly. Therefore, the use of the greases disclosed in

Waynick and Jao according to the method disclosed in Scheacke would not result in the claimed

method because there would not be any cleaning of contaminants off the bearing surfaces and the

grease used would not contain a polishing agent as required by the claimed method.

For the reasons discussed above, it is respectfully submitted that all of the claims as now

presented are patentable over the prior art. Accordingly, an early reconsideration and allowance

of this application is respectfully requested. Please charge \$120.00, the fee for a one-month

extension of time for filing this response for a large entity to the Locke Liddell & Sapp LLP

deposit account no. 12-1781. No other fees are believed to be due in connection with this paper.

The Commissioner is hereby authorized to charge any additional fee due in connection with the

filing of this paper to the Locke Liddell & Sapp LLP deposit account no. 12-1781.

Respectfully submitted,

Mark R. Backofen

Registration No. 51,423

Date: July 17, 2006

Locke Liddell & Sapp LLP

2200 Ross Avenue, Suite 2200

Serial Number: 10/655,860 Filing Date: 09/05/2003

Response to Office Action of 03/17/2006 Practitioner's Docket: 65448.00010

Dallas, TX 75201-6776 Telephone: (214) 740-8633 Facsimile: (214) 756-8633